Addressing the Problem of Untested Sexual Assault Kits (SAKs)

Where Do We Start?

Rebecca Campbell, Ph.D. Professor of Psychology Michigan State University



Today's Presentation

 PURPOSE: To provide succinct overview of key issues communities will face when resolving untested SAKs

 APPROACH: Empirically-based to share what we do and don't yet know about these issues based on research & practice

Today's Presentation

- TOPICS: Issues to be aware of regarding . . .
 - Terminology and definitions
 - Assessing scope of untested SAKs
 - Understanding underlying causes
 - Developing testing plans
 - Developing victim notification plans
 - Where to start??!!

Clarifying Terminology

Does it matter what we call this?

Does it matter what we call this?

"Backlogged kits"

"Unsubmitted kits"

"Untested kits"

Does it matter what we call this?

What's in a name? That which we call a rose By any other name would smell as sweet.

Shakespeare, *Romeo and Juliet*, Act II, scene ii

Important to be **AWARE** of differences in terminology



"BACKLOG" _____ "BACKLOGGED KITS"

 Kits that WERE submitted by the police to a forensic lab for testing, but the kit is still waiting to be tested



"BACKLOG" _____ "BACKLOGGED KITS"

 Kits that WERE submitted by the police to a forensic lab for testing, but the kit is still waiting to be tested



SOURCE: Nelson, 2010; Ritter, 2011

HERE



"UNTESTED KITS" _________ "UNSUBMITTED KITS"

Kits that were NOT submitted for testing; placed in police property & remain there



"UNSUBMITTED KITS"

Kits that were NOT submitted for testing; placed in police property & remain there



"UNSUBMITTED KITS"

Kits that were NOT submitted for testing; placed in police property & remain there

Assessing the Scope of the Problem

How Many Unsubmitted SAKs Are There In The U.S.?



Why Is This Hard to Figure Out?

- National census ALL law enforcement agencies to count ALL kits in police property
 - Using the same terminology and definitions
 - Using the same "count rules"
 - For some agencies, this could require a manual count
 - Lack of computerized systems for tracking evidence.

Alternate Approaches: Estimated Counts

- Nationally representative survey of state and local agencies, providing *estimated* counts
 - Cost effective for identifying scope and scale:
 - Nearly 1 in 5 unsolved sexual assault cases had forensic evidence that was unsubmitted.
 - Substantial proportion (41%) of unsubmitted sexual assault evidence with small and mid-sized agencies.
 - Precision of reporting dependent on agency's ability to track evidence.
 - Not as useful for targeted agency-level analysis.

Alternate Approaches: City-by-City Census

Complete count of all SAKs in specific cities

- FOIA/public records requests
- Sometimes "self-initiated" in a jurisdiction
- Compiled and tracked for public awareness



SOURCE: www.endthebacklog.org

How Many Unsubmitted SAKs Are There In There in YOUR JURISDICTION?

Assessing Scope: Where To Start

- Multidisciplinary team
- Define & clarify:
 - Scope of count: agency, city, county, region, state
 - Nature of records: database or manual
 - Date range: from _____ date to _____ date
 - Kit status: tested or untested?
 - Case status: adjudicated or not adjudicated?

Assessing Scope: Resources

Step-by-Step

Guides from the

Detroit SAK Census



Assessing Scope: Resources

Lessons Learned

Guides from the

Detroit SAK Census

Lessons Learned: Conducting a SAK Census

The take-home lessons from the Detroit SAK ARP based on their experiences conducting a census of SAKs in police property.

"What we should have done, in twenty-twenty-hindsight, if only we'd known."

1. Bring everyone to the table

A review of kits will bring up complex legal, psychological, and evidentiary issues, Have a broad-based multidisciplinary team to ensure that diverse perspectives will be considered at every stage of the process.

Consider including representatives from:

- o Police
- a Prosecution
- p. Forensic sciences
- o Medical/nursing
- Systems-based advocacy
- Community-based advocacy

Clarify language and agree on terms to be used

The extent to which team members can be consistent and precise in their language, planning and conducting the census will result in fewer opportunities for miscommunication.

2. Formulate goals

Establishing the goals of the project at the beginning will help streamline the process and save staffing time.



More expansive goals might focus on determining the number of SAKs and review each for SOL-risk, prosecution potential, and other such complex issues.

Some Terms to Consider:

Submitted= the SAK was/was not submitted to a laboratory for testing

Tested= the SAK was tested (for older kits, clarify whether that testing included DNA analysis

Adjuctionted= the SAK is associated with a case that has already been adjudicated (note: this should be cross-checked with testing status, as some cases may have been adjudicated without the testing of the kir)

Baoklagged= the SAK was submitted to a laboratory for testing, but is still in queue at the lab to be tested



7. Start small

Review a small sample of kits, even as few as 10 kits/cases. This will help clarify goals, identify available resources, determine what information is hard to track down, and gauge what resources/staffing will be necessary in the future. Use the following steps to take one SAK and walk through it, start to finish:

Take one SAK and walk through it, start to finish

- Determine info on the outside of the kit
- Assess whether such info is important & should be included in the database
- Determine what other info needs to be tracked down according to the predetermined goals
- Determine where other info may be found

- Pull records for each test-run SAK and identify problems with this process
- Decide what fields from these additional sources should be included in the central database
- Track how many staffing hours went into "walking through" each SAK/case



What works for one, might not work for another

Resource guides provide ideas & lessons learned

Understanding Underlying Causes

Why Did This Happen?

Why Do So Many U.S. Cities Have Large Numbers of Untested SAKs?

There's No ONE Reason

Underlying Reasons

- ✓ DNA testing did not exist!
- ✓ No policy regarding SAK testing
- ✓ No funding to test all SAKs
- ✓ Utility to *investigation stage* unclear
- Insufficient staffing to investigate and prosecute all cases
- Victim-blaming beliefs and misinterpreting signs of trauma

Date To: OIC 1.5 Subject: THIS COMPLET IS DEEP. SHE TELLS THIS STORY. NO-TEARS NONE !!! THE TIMES ARE OFF. I TALKED WITH THE DR. ALL HE FOUND WAS A LITTLE WHITE DISCHARGE NO TRAVMA !!! WHO CAN FIGURE IT !!!! OVER, GOODLUCK

THE COMPLE TOOK A CAD HOME AFTER THE AllEGED SEX ASSAULT SHE CALLED & CAS; AND WAITED FOR IT! SHE DID NOT CALL HOME; DID NOT ASK FOR HELP WHILE WAITING FOR & CAB, DID NOT DIAL 911 THE LOUPLT HAS NOT TOLD HER MOTHER THE STORY LS OF MY INTERVIEW. WHEN I DEGAN TO QUESTION WHY A CAD AND NOT HOME? WHY WANT FOR LAB ANTS NOT ASK FOR HELP AT THE STORE WHILE WAITING THE TENES BEGIN TO FLOW ANDTHE ATTITUDE SET. IN.



Strike a balance between looking back and moving forward

Yes, you have to look back and identify what was problematic and why . . . And then you have to move forward . . . Think of this as an opportunity to make good, long-standing policies and practices.

Developing a Testing Plan

What's the Best Plan for Testing Previously-Unsubmitted SAKs?




DNA is only useful for stranger sexual assault cases, so stranger rape SAKs should be prioritized for testing (or only these SAKs should be tested)



One person's stranger is another person's known friend, associate, partner \rightarrow so it is important to keep CODIS populated so it remains useful for investigations & prosecutions



DNA is not useful for non-stranger sexual assault cases because the offender's identity is already known



Testing could show pattern of serial sexual offending through DNA matches/CODIS hits across multiple cases (he-said—she-said, she-said, she-said . . .)



If the statute of limitations (SOL) has expired, testing SAK is not reasonable use of public funds



Case might *not* be SOL-expired, but if it is, evidence in other cases of prior bad acts (404b) may be allowable



If the victim is unwilling to prosecute, then it is not a reasonable use of public funds to test the SAK



Strong evidence that the "victim unwilling" designation in police report is often unreliable and inaccurate representation of victims' intentions & wishes

TEST ALL?

TEST SOME?

TEST SMART?

TEST ALL?

TEST SOME?

TEST SMART?

What Does Research Say?

- No empirical evaluations of "test all" policies
- There has been one empirical evaluation of different prioritization plans
 - Merit in testing BOTH stranger and non-stranger SAKs
 - Merit in testing BOTH SOL-expired & unexpired SAKs

What Does Research Say?

- Testing will yield a SUBSTANTIAL number of CODIS hits and serial sexual offenders
- Jurisdictions struggle with how to manage & coordinate testing results & investigations

Testing Plans: Where To Start

- Multidisciplinary team
- Assess resources available for testing
- Assess resources for coordinating post-testing investigations, prosecutions, victim advocacy
- Assess staffing needs and resources
- Check DNA exemption laws, and statute of limitations in your state

Testing Plans: Resources

Step-by-Step

Guides from

Developing the

Detroit Testing Plan



Testing Plans: Resources

Lessons Learned

from the Detroit Testing

Lessons Learned: Developing a SAK Testing Plan

The take-home lessons from the Detroit SAK ARP based on their experiences developing and evaluating a SAK testing plan.

"Where do you start? How do you eat an elephant? One bite at a time."

1. Bring everyone to the table



If a multidisciplinary team was formed to plan & execute the SAK census, then those same individuals/ organizations are well-positioned to guide the development of a testing plan. If the census was completed without the multidisciplinary team, then forming one for the testing phase is paramount. SAK testing raises complex legal, psychological, and evidentiary issues; representatives from police, prosecutian, forensic sciences, medical/nursing, systems-based advocacy, and community-based advocacy, help ensure that diverse perspectives are considered.

Discuss the purpose & utility of SAK testing

Explore how different team members think about the purpose and value of SAK testing. It's likely that these opinions will be deeplyrooted in their profession & their discipline's roles & responsibilities to society. It is not necessary to come to complete agreement on all issues; the team may "agree to disagree" on some issues and still move forward.

OPINIONS MIGHT INCLUDE:

- Testing is most useful in stranger assault cases.
- Testing is less useful in non-stranger cases because the identity of the assailant is already known.
- Testing can be useful in non-stranger cases to identify patterns of serial non-stranger assaults.
- Cases that are likely SOL-expired should not be tested to conserve limited testing resources.
- Cases that are likely SOL-expired should be tested in the event a CODIS hit links to a current case.

Good Advice

12. What happens after testing?

Devote appropriate attention to developing a plan for what happens after testing; starting small will likely help with this decision. The following are some key issues to consider:

- Who should be informed re: testing results?
- How will post-testing investigations be coordinated?
- How will case-to-case CODIS hits be handled?
- How will current caseloads be handled with these new/old cases being re-opened?
- Can a flexible process be developed to respond to highly time-sensitive cases?

Developing a Victim Notification Protocol

What's the Best Way to Notify Victims and (Re) Engage Them?



VICTIM NOTIFICATION raises complex

LEGAL ISSUES

VICTIM NOTIFICATION raises complex

LEGAL ISSUES

and . . .

PSYCHOLOGICAL ISSUES

What Is Victim Notification?

Re-activation of assault memories

- Could trigger flashbacks and other symptoms
- Could exacerbate PTSD and/or other MH
- Could increase substance use/abuse
- Could trigger substance abuse relapse

Key Guiding Principles

Victim-Centered

Trauma-Informed

- The victim is at the center of all decisions regarding recovery and any involvement with the criminal justice system
- Victim's choice, safety, & well-being is the focus
- The needs of the victim are everyone's concern and a collective effort (not just victim advocacy)

"Trauma Informed"

- Attending to victims' emotional safety AND physical safety
- Strengthening victims' capacity to recover with information, resources, services, and support
- Educating victims, service providers, and the general community about the impact of trauma on survivors' health and well-being.

What Does Research Say?

Limited research/evaluation to date on this

- Evidence that victim-centered, trauma-informed principles do work
 - Most victims NOT having adverse reactions to notification
 - Most victims DO choose to re-engage
 - Most victims DO connect/re-connect with services

Victim Notification: Where To Start

- Multidisciplinary team
- Start developing your protocol as soon as possible; do not wait until testing is underway
- Assess resources and supports for survivors (before, during, after notification)
- Training for all notifying personnel on neurobiology of trauma and trauma-informed interviewing

Victim Notification: Resources

Step-by-Step

Guide on How to

Create a Victim

Notification Protocol



Victim Notification: Resources

Step-by-Step

Guide on How to

Implement Victim

Notification Protocol

DISCUSSION 1A. AS SAKS DECISION 1A. The collaborative engaged ISSUE 1 began to be submitted for in a multi-week learning process before testing, the collaborative developing any protocol regarding the began to actively plan for victim notification process. how to notify victims HOW & WHEN Presentations were given by The 400 regarding the testing SHOULD THE Project, front-line practitioners results. The group wanted COLLABORATIVE (prosecution, law enforcement, and to learn about the START PLANNING advocacy who had done CODIS hit experiences of The 400. FOR VICTIM notification before), & representatives Project and other NOTIFICATION? from a national victim advocacy organizations to avoid organization. The collaborative also "reinventing the wheel." reviewed webinars from other national victim organizations The research/evaluation team reviewed the literature on the neurobiology of trauma and its implication for victim notification and presented a summary to the group. This process shed some light on the issues, questions, & multidisciplinary differences that would present crop up during this project. **DISCUSSION 1B. It was** DECISION 1B. The team decided to have difficult to devote sufficient a two-day weekend retreat in order to time to discuss victim have the sufficient time and space to notification in-depth at the develop victim notification protocols. regularly scheduled meetings, but the group needed to develop a notification plan quickly as the SAKs would soon be

returning from testing.

Testing Plans: Resources

Lessons Learned

from the Detroit

Victim Notification

Lessons Learned: Conducting Victim Notifications

The take-home lessons from the Detroit SAK ARP based on their experiences developing a victim notification protocol.

"How we tried to do the right thing after the right thing wasn't done a long time ago."



1. Bring everyone to the table

Notification involves complex legal, psychological, and evidentiary issues. While only some disciplines may be involved in conducting the actual notification (e.g., law enforcement, advocacy), having a broad-based multidisciplinary team to ensure that diverse Consider including representatives from:

- Police
- Prosecution
- Forensic sciences
- Medical/nursing
 Systems-based
- advocacy
- Community-based advocacy

 Clarify what decisions are and are not open to multidisciplinary input

perspectives will be considered at every stage of

the process is important.

There are many ways in which the multidisciplinary review, input, and debriefing sessions may be done (e.g., an oversight steering committee, a separate working group, etc.) and how offen it needs to be done (weekly, monthly, quarterly, ad-hoc).

However this process pans out, it is helpful to clarify which individuals/organizations have decision making authority over what issues. While some decisions may be made through collaborative discussion and consensus, others may be made sollely by one discipline. However, even it decision-making authority is held by only one individual/ organization, collaborative input can help inform that decision.



11. Start small—and be flexible

Develop draft notification protocols, implement them with a small number of cases, evaluate them (either formally or informally through multidisciplinary team debriefings), make changes, and implement/re-evaluate the revised procedures. Because each sexual assault case is unique, the victim notification protocols should be flexible to accommodate unusual and/or urgent situations.

<Deep Breath> Now What?

Settle in and take the long view . . . This is a problem many years in the making, and it will take many years to fix it.

Form a multidisciplinary work group, like a SART

Team building and training

Multidisciplinary Teams: Resources

Lessons Learned

from the Detroit MDT

Lessons Learned: Conducting an Action Research Project

The take-home lessons from the Detroit SAK ARP based on their Experiences participating in a multidisciplinary action research project.

"Multidisciplinary is easy to say, but hard to do."

1. There needs to be a champion (gr champions for the cause)

Addressing the problem of untested SU(3 is a long and arabatis problem of untested SU(3 is a and/ar argoritations will fael pressures to make the problem go away as quickly as gossible. The wark of contronting, resolving and then preventing this problem from happening again is clang-term ended/or as such, there needs to be a champion (ar champions) of the cause. An individual (or multiple individuals) who have long-term standing and respect in the administrating and respect in the administrating and respect in the administrations and systems engaged in the work of solving the problem.



2. Forming a multidisciplinary team is important, out guiging a team is guiging more important.

Forming a multialsolplinary, working group is essential' however it may not be reasonable to expect that these Individuals/organizations have much experience-or interest-in Working together (of least of fist). The results of this action research project highlight that years of poorsystemic collaboration can be a controuting factor to the development of this problem. Therefore, blocating time to learn about the loss of each team memoer and the work of each organization is ortical. Team building potrities-particularly in the beginning of the project-to help the group coolesce and work together effectively is aso useful.

Multidisciplinary Teams: Resources





ONLINE LEARNING · ON-SITE LEARNING · EVENTS · ABOUT US · TRY IT · BLOG Q

SANE-SART ONLINE + CLINICAL

HOME

A POWERFUL LEARNING PROGRAM FOR PROVIDING SUPPORT AND JUSTICE TO SEXUAL ASSAULT VICTIMS.



What works for one, might not work for another

Resource guides provide ideas & lessons learned



